

Monuments en écriture 'phags-pa. Pièces de chancellerie en transcription chinoise. Indices verborum linguae Mongolicae monumentis traditorum III by L. Ligeti; Trésor des sentences. Subhāṣitaratnanidhi de Sa-skya Paṇḍita, traduction de Sonom Gara. Monumenta linguae Mongolicae collecta IV by L. Ligeti; Trésor des sentences. Subhāṣitaratnanidhi de Sa-skya Paṇḍita, traduction de Sonom Gara. Indices verborum linguae Mongolicae ...
Review by: I. de Rachewiltz
Monumenta Serica, Vol. 33 (1977-1978), pp. 493-497
Published by: Monumenta Serica Institute
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/40726273
Accessed: 23/03/2013 15:53

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Monumenta Serica Institute is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Monumenta Serica*.

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Egerod's fluent English as a standard and a model.

Professor Egerod has given us a valuable monograph. He has raised high expectations. With a little revision it could appeal to a much wider audience.

Paul B. Denlinger, Taipei

---

1. L. Ligeti. *Monuments en écriture 'phags-pa. Pièces de chancellerie en transcription chinoise. Indices verborum linguae Mongolicae monumentis traditorum* III. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó, 1973. 243 pp;
2. L. Ligeti. *Trésor des sentences. Subhāṣitaratnanidhi de Sa-skya Paṇḍita, traduction de Sonom Gara. Monumenta linguae Mongolicae collecta* IV. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó, 1973. 146 pp;
3. L. Ligeti. *Trésor des sentences. Subhāṣitaratnanidhi de Sa-skya Paṇḍita, traduction de Sonom Gara. Indices verborum linguae Mongolicae monumentis traditorum* IV. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó, 1973. 329 pp.

The first volume under review is the *Index verborum* of vol. III of Professor Ligeti's *Monumenta linguae Mongolicae collecta* (hereafter *Monumenta*) which appeared in 1972. This comprised two sections or groups of documents: Mongol texts in 'phags-pa script from various sources, mostly epigraphical, and the texts in Chinese transcription incorporated in the famous *Hua-i i-yü* 華夷譯語 of 1389. The majority of documents in both groups are "pièces de chancellerie" of the pre-classical period (13th-14th c.), hence Ligeti's excellent reason for editing all this important material in one volume.

In the *Index* the texts of the first group are indexed on pp.9-112, those of the second group on pp.117-242. With regard to the first group of documents, a comparison with Professor N. Poppe's *The Mongolian Monuments in ḥP'ags-pa Script*[1] is called forth.

In *Monumenta* III, pp.9-10, Ligeti has pointed out that Poppe's book does not cover all the Mongol documents in 'phags-pa script that are now available (i.e. up to 1972). The texts edited and translated by Poppe are only 13, although

---

1) 2nd ed., translated and edited by J.R. Krueger (Wiesbaden, 1957).

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

the Glossary (pp.119-133) incorporates also all the new words that occur in the inscriptions published between 1941 and 1957—the years elapsing between the first (Russian) edition and the second enlarged edition of Poppe's *opus*. Ligeti has edited altogether 22 texts. His work is, therefore, quite comprehensive and includes important texts not described by Poppe, such as the inscriptions published by E. Haenisch,[2] the edict of Qaišan published by G. Tucci,[3] and the Fragments A and C of the 14th c. blockprint of the *Subhāṣitaratnanidhi*.[4] One item, however, which is not included in Ligeti's *Corpus* is the fragment of a bilingual—'phags-pa and Chinese—text in the collection of Tenri University Library, first published by Iwamura Shinobu and Tanaka Kenji in 1962,[5] and subsequently described by H. Franke in *Serta Tibeto-Mongolica*.[6]

It should also be mentioned that the transcription system used by Ligeti differs considerably from that of Poppe, one of the major differences being Ligeti's notation of long vowels;[7] thus, Poppe's *q·a-nu/qa·anu* is, in Ligeti's system, *qā-nu/qān-u*.[8] In the *Index*, as in Poppe's Glossary, only the form in transcription is entered. Regrettably, the abbreviations as listed on p.[7] of the *Index* do not correspond to those employed in the body of the work, e.g. "Ph" is replaced by "P."

In the second part of the *Index* are listed all words and expressions occurring only in Part Two (下) of the *Hua-i i-yü*, all the Mongol words found in Part One (上), i.e. in the Chinese-Mongolian vocabulary, being excluded.[9]

Ligeti's edition of these precious documents of the early Ming is a great improvement over the previous editions of Lewicki[10] and of Haenisch;[11] it has

---

2) In *Steuergerechtsame der chinesischen Klöster unter der Mongolenherrschaft* (Leipzig, 1940).

3) In *Tibetan Painted Scrolls* (Roma, 1949) II, pp.621-624.

4) On which see Ligeti in *AOHung.* 17 (1964),239-292. Fragment B is actually described by Poppe, *op. cit.*, p.59, but this fact is not mentioned by Ligeti (see *Monumenta* III, pp.99, 107-108).

5) *Tōhō-gakuhō* 32 (1962),190.

6) *Festschrift für Walther Heissig zum 60. Geburtstag* (Wiesbaden, 1973), pp.97-103.

7) On this problem see Ligeti in *AOHung.* 13 (1961), 225-237.

8) The first form is the transliteration of the 'phags-pa word, the second form is its transcription.

9) They will be dealt with by Ligeti in a future work devoted to the Sino-Mongolian vocabularies. See *AOHung.* 18 (1965), 266, n.106.

10) M. Lewicki, *La langue mongole des transcriptions chinoises du XIVe siècle. Le Houa-yi yi-yu de 1389* (Wrocław, 1949), pp.135-146.

11) E. Haenisch, *Sino-mongolische Dokumente vom Ende des 14. Jahrhunderts* (Berlin, 1952), pp.21-26.

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

also the additional advantage of giving the reconstructed Middle Mandarin forms of all Chinese words, terms and proper names. The obvious errors in the Chinese transcription—in which the documents have been handed down—have been tacitly corrected by Ligeti and the missing final consonants of syllables and words have been added in square brackets. Redundant characters, such as dittographies, have been transcribed within angle brackets. With regard to these, however, one may raise the question as to whether the *n* in words like *eǰe<n>le'ülüyü* and *nike<n>dü'er* (*Index*, pp.151 and 204) are, as Ligeti claims, "caractères superflus reproduits dans la transcription par erreur."[12] This phenomenon is evident also in the *Secret History of the Mongols*, where we find forms like *qonint* (=*qonind*) and *qadunt* (=*qatund*) alongside *qonit* and *qadut*. According to A. Mostaert, the forms with *n* are not faulty; on the contrary, it is certain that in Medieval Mongolian the plural suffix could be joined to a noun ending in *-n* without loss of the *-n*.[13] The same phenomenon did probably occur also with suffixes other than that of the plural. In his posthumously published work on the *Hua-i i-yü*, Mostaert has in fact retained the *n* in the words in question.[14]

The reconstruction of some proper names is also open to discussion, e.g. "Gülki" listed in the *Index*, p.159. The Chinese transcription of this name is 古里哥[15] and it is most unlikely that the character 哥 could represent Mongolian *ki*. Mostaert transcribes the name as "Güligö."[16]

Like other volumes in this series, the present *Index* too leaves something to be desired as regards setting and printing. But these are minor faults and the *Index* will be a handy tool for all those working on Mongolian preclassical texts. By quoting also the sentences in which the individual words occur in the text, this volume is a useful companion to the glossaries prepared by Poppe and by Mostaert which enter only single words.

The second and third volumes under review are Ligeti's edition of the Mongol preclassical version of the *Subhāṣitaratnanidhi* (hereafter *Sub.*) and the accompanying *Index* volume. As the basis for the present edition Ligeti has used the Budapest MS. of *Sub.*—a late 16th c. copy from Inner Mongolia containing both the original Tibetan text and the Mongol translation. The Budapest MS. was published in facsimile in 1948 as Vol. VI of *Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica*.[17] It is from this

---

12) *Monumenta* III, p.132.

13) A. Mostaert, *Sur quelques passages de l'Histoire secrète des Mongols*, rep. in one volume (Cambridge, Mass., 1953), p.109. As noted by Mostaert, this phenomenon occurs also in the *Muqaddimat al-Adab*.

14) *Le matériel mongol du Houa i i iu* 華夷譯語 *de Houng-ou* (1389), éd. par I. de Rachewiltz (Bruxelles, 1977), pp.53, 79.

15) *Hua-i i-yü*, IIB, 16a3.

16) *Le matériel mongol*, p.58.

17) L. Ligeti, *Le Subhāṣitaratnanidhi mongol. Un document du moyen mongol* I (Budapest, 1948).

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

MS. that we know the name of the Mongol translator, a Tantric priest called Sonom Gara.

In preparing his edition for *Monumenta,* Ligeti has utilised also two other MSS. (both later copies), as well as the extant fragments of a 14th c. blockprint of the Mongol translation of *Sub.* in 'phags-pa script.[18] The variant readings have not been indicated throughout as they will be given in a future critical edition, but Ligeti has justified his readings, when necessary, by quoting in brackets those of the other MSS. Ligeti's edition had been published in provisional form already in 1965,[19] but it was unfortunately known to Professor J.E. Bosson too late to be fully utilised in preparing his own transcription and translation of the *Sub.*[20] As already pointed out by another reviewer, Ligeti's text is useful in correcting some of Bosson's readings.[21] On the other hand, some of Ligeti's readings can be improved by a comparison with Bosson's transcription. For instance, *toγusun* in *Sub.* 2c (= Stanza 2, line 3) and 35c should be read *toγosun,* as Bosson does; see the *Secret History of the Mongols,* §§170 and 173: *to'osun;*[22] *Hua-i i-yü,* I, 2a5: *to'osun;*[23] cf. Ordos *t'ōsu̯.*[24] Bosson's reading *gürü* in *Sub.* 2d, 248b and 342c is preferable to Ligeti's *kürü;* see A. Mostaert and F.W. Cleaves, *Les Lettres de 1289 et 1305 des ilkhan Arγun et Öljeitü à Philippe le Bel* (Cambridge, Mass., 1962), pp.45-46. In *Sub.* 34c Ligeti's reading *kürtegsen* should be amended to *kürtegsed.* The examples could be easily multiplied, but these differences are usually small and of little consequence. Typographical errors are also fairly numerous; although more irritating than misleading, they occasionally affect the reliability of the text, as when single words are broken into two separate units, e.g. *qaγar<a> qai* for *qaγar<a>qai* (179d). These cases are fortunately rare.

The *Index* volume is of great help in locating words and sentences in this rather long text and it can be used, of course, as an index to Bosson's edition and translation. Although some faulty readings in the text edition have been corrected in the *Index,*[25] a quick check has revealed a not inconsiderable number of errors and inconsistencies. The following have been found in eight pages chosen at

---

18) On which see *Monumenta* III, pp.99-108.

19) In the series of preclassical Mongolian texts *Mongol Nyelvemlėktàr,* vol. VI (Budapest, 1965).

20) J.A. Bosson, *A Treasury of Aphoristic Jewels: The Subhāṣitaratnanidhi of Sa Skya Paṇḍita in Tibetan and Mongolian* (Bloomington, 1969).

21) G. Doerfer in *UAJ* 46 (1974), 187.

22) I. de Rachewiltz, *Index to the Secret History of the Mongols* (Bloomington, 1962), p.320a.

23) Mostaert, *Le matériel mongol,* p.101.

24) A Mostaert, *Dictionnaire ordos* II (Peking, 1942), p.672a, where mo. *toγusun* must also be amended. See Poppe in *HJAS* 14 (1951), 196-197.

25) E.g. the *kürtegsen* in *Sub.* 34c has been changed to *kürtegsed* (p.7).

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

random (5-7, 101, 152-154, 204): p.5, 1.3: *for* 139 *read* 139b; p.5, 1.4 (from bottom): *for* W08d *read* 208d; p.6, 1.6 (from bottom): *for* genül *read* genül; p.7, 1.5: *for* 10c *read* 10b; p.152, 1.10: *for* 167 *read* 167b; p.153, 1.10 (from bottom): *for* kičiyegči *read* kičigegči; p.154, 1.10: *for* 251a *read* 251d; p.154, 1.1 (from bottom): *for* -yügen *read* -yügen; p.204, 1.11: *for* manaγdayu *read* manaγdayu (cf. 1.12 and p.299, 11.6-7); the text edition (66c on p.43) has, however, manaγ̃dayu, which seems to be a mistake. Thus, only one page (101) in eight that were checked is free from typographical or other errors.

In spite of these shortcomings, which are inevitable in a work of this size and complexity, the volumes under review, like the other volumes in the two series of *Monumenta* and *Indices,* are very important contributions, and we must all be grateful to Professor Ligeti and his team for assuming the unenviable task of bringing them out.

I. de Rachewiltz, Canberra

Köke Sudur Nova (*Inǰannasi's Manuscript of the Expanded Version of his Blue Chronicle*), part I. Edited with introduction and index by Gombojab Hangin. Asiatische Forschungen, Band 58. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1978. xxx, facsimilia: 1–239 pp.

Professor Hangin's interest in the *Köke Sudur* and its author goes back many years; for a long time he has devoted much effort to investigate the career and literary activity of the Mongol nobleman Inǰannasi (1837–1892) (Prof. N. Poppe thinks that the name is a corruption of Skr. *Vijñâna* "practical knowledge" + *si* [Tib. *śes* "intelligence"]) from Eastern Mongolia; and one of Inǰannasi's works in particular has been the subject of his investigations, the "historical" narrative *Köke Sudur* "Blue Chronicle" of the Mongols. Other publications apart, in 1973 Prof. Hangin published an English translation of Inǰannasi's introduction to the *Köke Sudur* in which the author explains his views on history and literature and the purpose of his story.[1]

---

1) *Köke Sudur* (*The Blue Chronicle*), *A Study of the First Mongolian Historical Novel by Injannasi*, Asiat. Forsch., Bd 38. Wiesbaden, 1973. Reviews: by N. Poppe, in *Journal of Asian History* 8 (1974), pp. 83–85; G. Doerfer in *Central Asiatic Journal* 18 (1974), pp. 270–271; H. Serruys, in *Monumenta Serica* 30 (1972-1973) (issued 1974), pp. 669–672.

This content downloaded from 89.179.117.36 on Sat, 23 Mar 2013 15:53:24 PM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions